

Report Identification Number: BU-19-045

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: Apr 16, 2020

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns: A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships							
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child					
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child					
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father					
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider					
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father					
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle					
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub					
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult						
Contacts							
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner					
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services					
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother					
CPS-Child Protective Services							
Allegations							
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts					
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding					
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse					
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect					
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive					
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision					
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other						
	Miscellaneous						
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender					
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence					
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police					
Service	Services	Department					
PPRS-Purchased Preventive	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy	FC-Foster Care					
Rehabilitative Services	Families						
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services					
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan					
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment					
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old					
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation	ASTO-Allowing Sex Abuse to Occur						



Case Information

Report Type: Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Erie **Date of Death:** 12/15/2019

Age: 1 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 12/15/2019

Presenting Information

An SCR report alleged the 1-month-old male subject child and his twin lived with their parents, aunt and uncle. On 12/15/19, at about 5:00 AM, the parents fed the children and went to sleep. The father was sleeping on the couch with the subject child. The mother was sleeping on a different couch and the twin was in a bassinet. The aunt and uncle were somewhere else in the home. At about 12:20 PM, the father found the subject child not breathing and immediately called 911. The child was an otherwise healthy child and did not appear to have any visible injuries about his body. The adults in the home had no explanation for the child's death, therefore all were made subjects of the SCR report.

Executive Summary

This fatality report concerns the death of a 1-month-old male subject child who died on 12/15/19. A report was made to the SCR on the same day. The child resided with his parents, aunt, uncle, twin sibling and cousins, ages 8 months and 4 years.

Erie County Department of Social Services (ECDSS) coordinated investigative efforts with law enforcement immediately upon learning of the death. The parents did not have prior CPS history. An Autopsy was performed; however, the medical examiner's report was not completed at the time of this writing.

The parents reported the child and his twin acted normally the night prior to the child's death. Both parents said the father was sleeping on the couch with the child when he was found wedged between the couch cushion and the father. The child was unresponsive and not breathing. The parents alerted the aunt and uncle, called 911 and CPR was performed. EMS arrived at the home and took over resuscitation efforts, however, the child was declared deceased.

During the investigation, a safety plan was created with the family stating the grandparents would supervise the father's interactions with the sibling.

The aunt and uncle said the twins appeared normal the day prior to the child's death. The aunt and uncle stated the parents and twins recently moved into their home, as the parents were in a dispute with the paternal grandparents, where they resided prior to the death. The aunt and uncle did not see the parents co-sleeping with the twins while the parents stayed at their home. They did not have concerns for the care of the twin.

ECDSS gathered information regarding the child's death from the family, first responders and the medical examiner. No concerns were expressed for the care of the surviving children.

Several home visits were made throughout the investigation and an abundance of services were offered to the parents. It remained unknown if the aunt and uncle engaged in services. Following the death, the parents moved back into the home of the grandparents and were actively participating in a Preventive Services case. The services case was opened due to the mother's mental health challenges and to provide parenting classes to the parents. Additionally, the services case was opened to monitor the ongoing safety plan.

ECDSS substantiated the allegations of DOA/Fatality and Inadequate Guardianship against the parents regarding the child. The investigation revealed the father often co-slept with the child and his twin. ECDSS informed the parents of safe

BU-19-045 FINAL Page 3 of 11



sleep guidelines regarding the surviving sibling; however, it remained unknown if the parents had safe sleep knowledge prior to the child's death. The investigation determination noted it was apparent the parents did not have knowledge on how to appropriately care for infants and were referred to Preventive Services. ECDSS did not clearly document the reason for substantiating the allegation of DOA/Fatality against the parents. The investigation revealed the aunt and uncle were not persons legally responsible for the child, therefore the allegations of Inadequate Guardianship and DOA/Fatality were unsubstantiated.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:	
• Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:	
 Approved Initial Safety Assessment? 	Yes
 Safety assessment due at the time of determination? 	Yes
• Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?	Yes
Determination:	
 Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation? 	Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.
 Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate? 	Yes
Explain: Casework activity was commensurate with case circumstances.	
Was the decision to close the case appropriate?	N/A
Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements?	Yes
Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?	Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.
Explain:	
The case was opened for Preventive Services to monitor the mother's participation	with mental health providers and to

The case was opened for Preventive Services to monitor the mother's participation with mental health providers and to provide parenting classes.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality

Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes No

Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities



Adults: 0

Child Fatality Report

Incident Information						
Date of Death: 12/15/2019		Time of Death: Unknown				
Time of fatal incident, if diffe	erent than time of death:		Unknown			
County where fatality incider	nt occurred:		Erie			
Was 911 or local emergency i	number called?		Yes			
Time of Call:			12:18 PM			
Did EMS respond to the scen	e?		Yes			
At time of incident leading to	death, had child used alcoho	ol or drugs?	N/A			
Child's activity at time of inc	ident:					
☐ Sleeping	☐ Working	☐ Driving	g / Vehicle occupant			
☐ Playing	☐ Eating		wn			
Other						
Did child have supervision at	time of incident leading to d	leath? Yes				
At time of incident supervisor	r was:					
Drug Impaired		Absent				
Alcohol Impaired		⊠ Asleep				
Distracted		☐ Impaired by illness				
☐ Impaired by disability		Other:				
Total number of deaths at ind Children ages 0-18: 1	cident event:					

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Aunt/Uncle	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	28 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Aunt/Uncle	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	29 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	1 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	Alleged Perpetrator	Male	29 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	24 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Other Child - Cousin	No Role	Female	3 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Other Child - Cousin	No Role	Male	8 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Male	1 Month(s)

LDSS Response

On 12/15/19, ECDSS received the SCR report regarding the child's death. Within the first 24 hours of the investigation, ECDSS coordinated with law enforcement, contacted the source of the report, documented a CPS history check and assessed the safety of the surviving children.



Law enforcement provided information the father was sleeping with the child on the couch and the father fell asleep with the child on his chest. The child was found wedged between the back of the couch and the father.

On 12/15/19, the aunt and uncle were interviewed separately at their home while the aunt cared for the twin. The aunt saw the mother sleeping on the couch, and one child in the bassinet the night prior to the fatal incident. She did not know where the other child was. The aunt was awoken on 12/15/19 to the parents screaming the child was not breathing and reported the child to be purple, warm and limp. The aunt took the child from the mother and she and the uncle performed CPR until first responders arrived. The uncle said the twins were fine around 5:00 AM when the parents returned home from work with the twins. He assisted with the children by holding them while the parents prepared bottles. The uncle went to sleep and was awoken in the same manner as the aunt. He had no additional information to add.

ECDSS made a home visit to the cousin's relative's home to assess the safety of the cousins. They were deemed safe in the care of their family.

On 12/16/19, the father was interviewed. The parents took the twins with them while they worked for a food delivery service. The mother would care for the twins while the father drove. The father said he pulled the car over around 4:15 AM to feed the twins and they were fine. When they returned home around 5:45 AM, the uncle let them into the home and swaddled the twins and put them in their bassinet. Around dawn, the father laid the child on the father's chest and cradled the child in his arm as he was fussy, and this was a typical soothing technique. The child was placed on his right side against the back of the couch and to the left of the father. The child was resting against the father's arm. When the father awoke, the child was not breathing and was blue. He screamed for the other adults and CPR was performed. The father was not sure if he rolled over on the child.

On the same day, ECDSS learned from the medical examiner that the child had fractured ribs. ECDSS appropriately made a safety plan that the twin would be in the care of the grandparents and only have supervised visits with the father.

On 12/17/19, ECDSS spoke with the mother, who was admitted to a mental health facility after she expressed suicidal ideation due to the loss of the child. The mother said she had tucked a blanket around both twins' bodies; however, the child became fussy, so the father took the child out of the bassinet and rested with him on the couch. The mother did not have additional information to add.

Law enforcement informed ECDSS they were closing the criminal investigation without any findings as the death was ruled a natural death. ECDSS contacted the medical examiner, who stated the cause of death was not yet determined.

ECDSS spoke with several first responders and all reported the child was unresponsive upon arrival and the family was performing CPR until professionals took over. No concerns for the surviving children were brought to the Department's attention.

All required reports and Safety Assessments were completed timely and accurately, and the investigation was closed. ECDSS offered the parents bereavement service referrals which were accepted. The family agreed to participate in a Preventive Services case as they needed parenting classes and the Department deemed it appropriate to monitor the mother's mental heath treatment and status.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Pending

Primary Cause of Death: Unknown

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Unknown

BU-19-045 FINAL Page 6 of 11



Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team?Yes

Comments: The death was referred to the CFRT during the course of the investigation.

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
053061 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	053066 - Aunt/Uncle, Female, 28 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
053061 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	053066 - Aunt/Uncle, Female, 28 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
053061 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	053065 - Aunt/Uncle, Male, 29 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
053061 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	053065 - Aunt/Uncle, Male, 29 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
053061 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	053063 - Mother, Female, 24 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Substantiated
053061 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	053063 - Mother, Female, 24 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated
053061 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	053064 - Father, Male, 29 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Substantiated
053061 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Mons	053064 - Father, Male, 29 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Substantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?				
When appropriate, children were interviewed?	\boxtimes			
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	\boxtimes			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	\boxtimes			
Contact with source?				
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?				
Was a death-scene investigation performed?	\boxtimes			
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?				
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?				

BU-19-045 FINAL Page 7 of 11



Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?				
Fatality Safety Assessment Activities				
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	\boxtimes			
Was there an adequate assessment of impending or immediate danger to s household named in the report:	urviving	siblings/o	ther child	dren in the
Within 24 hours?	\boxtimes			
At 7 days?	\boxtimes			
At 30 days?	\boxtimes			
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?				
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?		\boxtimes		
When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?	\boxtimes			
Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment I	Profile			
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?	\boxtimes			
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?	\boxtimes			
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?	\boxtimes			
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?		\boxtimes		
Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case	\boxtimes			
Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality In	ivestigatio	n		
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine

BU-19-045 FINAL Page 8 of 11

 \boxtimes

Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving

care at any time during this fatality investigation?

siblings/other children in the household be removed or placed in foster



to this fatality?

Legal Activity Related to the Fatality

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling							
Economic support							
Funeral arrangements			\boxtimes				
Housing assistance						\boxtimes	
Mental health services							
Foster care						\boxtimes	
Health care						\boxtimes	
Legal services							
Family planning						\boxtimes	
Homemaking Services							
Parenting Skills							
Domestic Violence Services							
Early Intervention							
Alcohol/Substance abuse							
Child Care						\boxtimes	
Intensive case management	\boxtimes						
Family or others as safety resources	\boxtimes						
Other						\boxtimes	

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

A Preventive Services Stage was opened to provide ongoing services to the family.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? Yes

Explain:

The family was offered an abundance of services in response to the fatality.

BU-19-045 FINAL Page 9 of 11



History Prior to the Fatality

		Child Information				
Was the ch Were there	ld have a history of alleged chi ild ever placed outside of the h any siblings ever placed outsic ild acutely ill during the two w	ome prior to the death? de of the home prior to t	his child's death?	No No N/A No		
		Infants Under One Year	r Old			
Had med Misused Experien	egnancy, mother: dical complications / infections l over-the-counter or prescription nced domestic violence noted in the case record to have	_	☐ Had heavy a☐ Smoked tob☐ Used illicit	acco		
Infant was born: ☐ Drug exposed ☐ With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome ☐ With neither of the issues listed noted in case record						
CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality						
Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)	
	Other Child - Cousin, Female, 1 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Male, 25 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated	No	
	Other Child - Cousin, Female, 1 Years	Aunt/Uncle, Female, 26 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated		
Report Summary: An SCR report alleged on 12/24/17, the aunt and uncle argued, and the fight escalated to a physical altercation in the presence of the 3-year-old cousin. The aunt attempted to leave the home with the cousin in her arms and was pushed by the uncle. It was unknown if the cousin was injured.						
Report Determination: Unfounded Date of Determination: 02/22/2018						
ECDSS uns Although th	Determination: Substantiated the allegation of Inches domestic violence occurred, the			le regarding the c	ousin.	
ECDSS init The Safety domestic vi	iew Results: tiated the investigation timely, co Assessments and Risk Assessments olence referral. Required Actions related to the	ent Profiles were accurately				

BU-19-045 FINAL Page 10 of 11



CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There was no CPS history more than three years prior to the death.

Known CPS History Outside of NYS

There was no known CPS history outside of New York State.

Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Additional Local District Comments

We at the Erie County Department of Social Services appreciate the opportunity given us to review the draft report in advance. We find that the facts, as written, describe the unfortunate events and the actions taken in response. We are pleased that OCFS found that the fatality investigation was conducted appropriately and that there are no required actions related to the fatality or to the CPS investigation conducted during the three years preceding the fatality.

Recommended Action(s)

Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes?

Yes
No

Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? \square Yes \boxtimes No