

Report Identification Number: SV-17-041

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

**Issue Date: Jan 02, 2018** 

This report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:  A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



# Abbreviations

Relationships					
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child			
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child			
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father			
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider			
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father			
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle			
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling	PS-Parent Sub			
CH/CHN-Child/Children	OA-Other Adult				
	Contacts				
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner			
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services			
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother			
CPS-Child Protective Services					
	Allegations				
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts			
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding			
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse			
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect			
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive			
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision			
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Other				
	Miscellaneous				
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender			
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence			
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police			
Service	Services	Department			
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care			
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	COS-Court Ordered Services			
OP-Order of Protection	RAP-Risk Assessment Profile	FASP-Family Assessment Plan			
FAR-Family Assessment Response	Hx-History	Tx-Treatment			
CAC-Child Advocacy Center	PIP-Program Improvement Plan	yo- year(s) old			
CPR-Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation					



### **Case Information**

**Report Type:** Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Rockland **Date of Death:** 10/07/2017

Age: 1 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 10/09/2017

#### **Presenting Information**

An SCR report was received on 10/07/17, stating the 2-month-old SC passed away at home unexpectedly and there was no explanation for the death. The SM was at home with the SC when he stopped breathing. The SC was transported to the hospital at 3:10 pm, where he was pronounced dead.

#### **Executive Summary**

This report concerns the death of the 1-month-old male SC. Rockland County Department of Social Services (RCDSS) received an SCR report on 10/7/17 in regard to the fatality of the SC. The report alleged the SC died suddenly and for unexplained reasons while in the care of the SM. The SC was an otherwise healthy child.

The SM, BF, SC and 1-year-old SS were staying with the PGM and PGF when the fatal incident occurred. The family was visiting the paternal grandparents for a vacation and family wedding and reside outside of The United States. The SM, BF, SS and SC arrived to the United States in September 2017 and planned to leave at the end of October 2017. The SC was sleeping in a bassinet with appropriate bedding during the visit. The SM placed the SC in the bassinet for a nap after nursing him on the afternoon of 10/7/17. The SM placed the SC on his side to sleep as suggested by the SC's pediatrician. The SM explained that the SC had acid reflux and the pediatrician told her this position would be better. The SM noticed the SC rolled onto his stomach within minutes and found him unresponsive. Despite EMS and ER attempts to resuscitate the SC, he could not be saved.

LE also investigated and there were no criminal charges pursued against the SM. The ME requested X-rays be done at the ER and these showed no signs of trauma or injury. No autopsy was performed due to the religious beliefs of the SM and BF.

The SS was seen and assessed to be safe in the care of the parents. The SM, BF and SS returned to their home (outside the United States) within weeks of the SC's death. There were no service needs identified for the SM, BF and SS.

RCDSS made an appropriate determination to unsubstantiate the allegations of DOA/Fatality and IG against the SM regarding the SC. RCDSS found no credible evidence to suggest the SM's actions or inactions led to the death of the SC. RCDSS made multiple attempts to contact the SC's pediatrician to gather further information, but were unable to speak with the pediatrician.

### Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

#### **Safety Assessment:**

- Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:
  - Approved Initial Safety Assessment?

Yes



Safety assessment due at the time of determination?	Unable to Determine
• Was the safety decision on the approved Initial Safety Assessment appropriate?	Yes
Determination:	
<ul> <li>Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?</li> </ul>	
• Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?	eUnable to Determine
Was the decision to close the case appropriate?	Yes
Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory or regulatory requirements?	Yes
Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation?	Yes, the case record has detail of the consultation.
Explain: RCDSS appropriately concluded the CPS Investigation.	
Required Actions Related to the Fatal	ity
Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? Yes Fatality-Related Information and Investig	
Incident Information	
Date of Death: 10/07/2017 Time of Death:	Unknown
Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death:	Unknown
County where fatality incident occurred: Was 911 or local emergency number called? Fime of Call: Did EMS respond to the scene? At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs? Child's activity at time of incident:	Rockland Yes Unknown Yes No
Sleeping	☐ Driving / Vehicle occupant☐ Unknown
Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? Yes	

SV-17-041 FINAL Page 4 of 10

How long before incident was the child last seen by caretaker? 10 Minutes Is the caretaker listed in the Household Composition? Yes - Caregiver 1

2	NEW YORK STATE	Office of Children and Family Services
---	----------------------	--

Adults: 0

## **Child Fatality Report**

At time of incident supervisor was:	
☐ Drug Impaired	Absent
Alcohol Impaired	Asleep
□ Distracted	☐ Impaired by illness
☐ Impaired by disability	Other:
Total number of deaths at incident event:	
Children ages 0-18: 1	

#### **Household Composition at time of Fatality**

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	1 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Father	No Role	Male	22 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	22 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	No Role	Female	23 Month(s)

#### **LDSS Response**

RCDSS began their investigation on 10/7/17, upon receiving a report from the SCR regarding the death of the SC.

RCDSS jointly investigated the death with LE. LE reported the SM and BF had been interviewed previous to the SCR report. LE reported the SM and BF did not speak English, so the PGM served as an interpreter. The SM reported that around 1:30PM on 10/7/17 she breast fed the SC and put him to sleep in a bassinet. The SM reported about 5 minutes later she saw the SC was pale and not breathing and she brought him outside where a neighbor that works as EMS performed CPR. The ambulance was called and the SC was transported to the hospital where he was pronounced dead.

RCDSS went to the hospital initially and interviewed the PGF. The PGF had gone in the ambulance with the SC because the SM and BF could not leave the house due to a religious observance. At the time of the interview the PGF was in the room with the SC's remains, praying alongside him. The PGF explained the SM and BF,SC and 23-month-old SS were visiting from another country. The PGF stated the SC was a healthy and happy child. The PGF reported no concerns for the SC or SS.

RCDSS made two visits to the grandparents home to speak with the PGM, SM, BF and the SS. At the initial visit the PGM acted as a translator for the BF and SM as they did not speak English. The BM reported the SC, SS and herself had awoke at about 10:00AM on 10/7/17 and it was a usual day. The SM breast fed the SC every hour and a half and he slept in between feedings. At about 1:30PM the SM put the SC in the bassinet on his side, after he fell asleep while feeding. The SM checked on him about 7 minutes later and noted he was lying on his stomach and pale. The SM picked the SC up and yelled for the BF. The SM and BF then took the SC outside and yelled for the assistance of a neighbor who was EMS. The neighbor responded and began CPR until the ambulance and other EMS arrived. The SM reported after the CPR was done the SC had blood coming from his nose. The SC was taken to the hospital in the ambulance, accompanied by the PGF. RCDSS brought an interpreter from the community on the second visit to the home. The SM and BF reported the same version of events. They stated the SC had acid reflux, but was an otherwise healthy child. The SC and SS were seen by their pediatrician a week before they arriving to the United States on 9/19/17. The SM denied the SC was taking any medication. The PGM reported the same events as the SM and the PGF had limited information because he was in another part of the home when the fatal incident occurred.



The SS was observed to be developmentally appropriate and RCDSS had no concerns for her safety. It is not clear where the SS was at the time the SC was discovered unresponsive.

The SM and BF received safe sleep information in the hospital where the SC was born. The SM reported they told them children should sleep on their backs, but stated there were babies in the hospital nursery on their sides and stomach. The SM told RCDSS the pediatrician told her to lay the SC on his side to sleep, in an effort to ease the acid reflux. The SM denied anything was in the bassinet with the SC other than a receiving blanket.

RCDSS observed the bedroom where the SM, BF, SC and SS were sleeping while visiting the paternal grandparents. There were appropriate sleeping arrangements, including an empty bassinet. RCDSS took photographs for the case file.

RCDSS spoke with the ER physician regarding the fatality. The physician reported that x-rays of the SC were done and the SC had no trauma or injuries to his body. RCDSS requested and received the name and telephone number for the SS and SC's pediatrician and made several unsuccessful attempts to contact him.

#### Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Unknown

**Primary Cause of Death:** Unknown

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Hospital physician

#### Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)? Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

#### **SCR Fatality Report Summary**

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
042561 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Month(s)	041542 - Mother, Female, 22 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
042561 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Month(s)	·	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

#### **CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?	$\boxtimes$			
When appropriate, children were interviewed?			$\boxtimes$	
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	$\boxtimes$			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	$\boxtimes$			
Contact with source?	$\boxtimes$			
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	$\boxtimes$			



Was a death-scene investigation performed?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?				
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	$\boxtimes$			
Fatality Safety Assessment Activities				
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?	$\boxtimes$			
Was there an adequate safety assessment of impending or immediate dang in the household named in the report:	ger to sur	viving sib	olings/oth	er children
Within 24 hours?	$\boxtimes$			
At 7 days?	$\boxtimes$			
At 30 days?		$\boxtimes$		
Was there an approved Initial Safety Assessment for all surviving siblings/ other children in the household within 24 hours?	$\boxtimes$			
Are there any safety issues that need to be referred back to the local district?		$\boxtimes$		
When safety factors were present that placed the surviving siblings/other children in the household in impending or immediate danger of serious harm, were the safety interventions, including parent/caretaker actions adequate?				
Explain: The SS was no longer in the United States at the 30-day mark in the investigate	ion.	•		
Fatality Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment	Drafila			
Fatanty Risk Assessment / Risk Assessment	1 I UIIIC			
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Was the risk assessment/RAP adequate in this case?	$\boxtimes$			
During the course of the investigation, was sufficient information gathered to assess risk to all surviving siblings/other children in the household?				
Was there an adequate assessment of the family's need for services?				
Did the protective factors in this case require the LDSS to file a petition in Family Court at any time during or after the investigation?		$\boxtimes$		

SV-17-041 FINAL Page 7 of 10

Were appropriate/needed services offered in this case



### **Placement Activities in Response to the Fatality Investigation**

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
Did the safety factors in the case show the need for the surviving siblings/other children in the household be removed or placed in foster care at any time during this fatality investigation?				
Were there surviving children in the household that were removed either as a result of this fatality report / investigation or for reasons unrelated to this fatality?				

### **Legal Activity Related to the Fatality**

Was there legal activity as a result of the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity.

### Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality

Services	Provided After Death	Offered, but Refused	Offered, Unknown if Used	Not Offered	Needed but Unavailable	N/A	CDR Lead to Referral
Bereavement counseling						$\boxtimes$	
<b>Economic support</b>							
Funeral arrangements							
Housing assistance						$\boxtimes$	
Mental health services						$\boxtimes$	
Foster care							
Health care							
Legal services							
Family planning							
Homemaking Services							
Parenting Skills							
<b>Domestic Violence Services</b>							
Early Intervention							
Alcohol/Substance abuse							
Child Care							
Intensive case management							
Family or others as safety resources							
Other							

SV-17-041 FINAL Page 8 of 10



#### Additional information, if necessary:

The SM, BF and SS returned to their native country within 2 weeks following the SC's death. They had been visiting the PGM and PGF and were in the United States for a family wedding. It was not necessary to offer services because they would seek services when they returned home.

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? No

#### **Explain:**

The family lived outside the United States and were only visiting family in the U.S. when the fatality occurred. The SM, BF and SS were surrounded by family and had needed support. The family returned to their home country less than a month after the SC died.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? No

#### **Explain:**

The family lived outside the United States and were only visiting family in the U.S. when the fatality occurred. The SM, BF and SS were surrounded by family and had needed support. The family returned to their home country less than a month after the SC died.

History Prior to the Fatality					
Child Information					
Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatment?		No			
Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of death?		No			
Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the death?		No			
Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prior to this	child's death?	No			
Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?		No			
Infants Under One Year O	ld				
During pregnancy, mother:					
Had medical complications / infections	Had heavy alcohol	use			
Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs	☐ Smoked tobacco				
Experienced domestic violence	Used illicit drugs				
Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues listed					
Infant was born:					
Drug exposed	With fetal alcohol	effects or syndrome			
With neither of the issues listed noted in case record					
CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality					

#### CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality

There is no CPS investigative history in NYS within three years prior to the fatality.

SV-17-041 FINAL Page 9 of 10



There is no CPS history.
Known CPS History Outside of NYS
There is no known CPS history outside of NY State. The SM, BF, SC and SS resided in Israel and were visiting the United States at the time of the fatality.
Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality
Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity
Recommended Action(s)
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? ☐Yes ☒No  Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? ☐Yes ☒No