

Report Identification Number: SY-16-063

Prepared by: New York State Office of Children & Family Services

Issue Date: May 11, 2017

Thi	s report, prepared pursuant to section 20(5) of the Social Services Law (SSL), concerns:
\boxtimes	A report made to the New York Statewide Central Register of Child Abuse and Maltreatment (SCR) involving the death of a child.
	The death of a child for whom child protective services has an open case.
	The death of a child whose care and custody or custody and guardianship has been transferred to an authorized agency.
	The death of a child for whom the local department of social services has an open preventive service case.

The Office of Children and Family Services (OCFS) is mandated by section 20 of the SSL to investigate or cause for the investigation of the cause and circumstances surrounding the death, review such investigation, and prepare and issue a fatality report in regard to the categories of deaths noted above involving a child, except where a local or regional fatality review team issues a report, as authorized by law.

Such report must include: the cause of death; the identification of child protective or other services provided or actions taken regard to such child and child's family; any extraordinary or pertinent information concerning the circumstances of the child's death; whether the child or the child's family received assistance, care or services from the social services district prior to the child's death; any action or further investigation undertaken by OCFS or the social services district since the child's death; and as appropriate, recommendations for local or state administrative or policy changes.

This report contains no information that would identify the deceased child, his or her siblings, the parent, parents, or other persons legally responsible for the child, and any members of the deceased child's household.

By statute, this report will be forwarded to the social services district, chief county executive officer, chairperson of the local legislative body of the county where the child died and the social services district that had legal custody of the child, if different. Notice of the issuance of this report will be sent to the Speaker of the Assembly and the Temporary President of the Senate of the State of New York.

This report may <u>only</u> be disclosed to the public by OCFS pursuant to section 20(5) of the SSL. It may be released by OCFS only after OCFS has determined that such disclosure is not contrary to the best interests of the deceased child's siblings or other children in the household.

OCFS' review included an examination of actions taken by individual caseworkers and supervisors within the social services district and agencies under contract with the social services district. The observations and recommendations contained in this report reflect OCFS' assessment and the performance of these agencies.



Abbreviations

Relationships							
BM-Biological Mother	SM-Subject Mother	SC-Subject Child					
BF-Biological Father	SF-Subject Father	OC-Other Child					
MGM-Maternal Grand Mother	MGF-Maternal Grand Father	FF-Foster Father					
PGM-Paternal Grand Mother	PGF-Paternal Grand Father	DCP-Day Care Provider					
MGGM-Maternal Great Grand Mother	MGGF-Maternal Great Grand Father	PGGF-Paternal Great Grand Father					
PGGM-Paternal Great Grand Mother	MA/MU-Maternal Aunt/Maternal Uncle	PA/PU-Paternal Aunt/Paternal Uncle					
FM-Foster Mother	SS-Surviving Sibling						

	Contacts	
LE-Law Enforcement	CW-Case Worker	CP-Case Planner
DrDoctor	ME-Medical Examiner	EMS-Emergency Medical Services
DC-Day Care	FD-Fire Department	BM-Biological Mother
CPR-Cardio-pulmonary Resuscitation		
	Allegations	
FX-Fractures	II-Internal Injuries	L/B/W-Lacerations/Bruises/Welts
S/D/S-Swelling/Dislocation/Sprains	C/T/S-Choking/Twisting/Shaking	B/S-Burns/Scalding
P/Nx-Poisoning/ Noxious Substance	XCP-Excessive Corporal Punishment	PD/AM-Parent's Drug Alcohol Misuse
CD/A-Child's Drug/Alcohol Use	LMC-Lack of Medical Care	EdN-Educational Neglect
EN-Emotional Neglect	SA-Sexual Abuse	M/FTTH-Malnutrition/Failure-to-thrive
IF/C/S-Inadequate Food/ Clothing/ Shelter	IG-Inadequate Guardianship	LS-Lack of Supervision
Ab-Abandonment	OTH/COI-Others	
	Miscellaneous	
IND-Indicated	UNF-Unfounded	SO-Sexual Offender
Sub-Substantiated	Unsub-Unsubstantiated	DV-Domestic Violence
LDSS-Local Department of Social	ACS-Administration for Children's	NYPD-New York City Police
Service	Services	Department
PPRS-Purchased Preventive Rehabilitative Services	TANF-Temporary Assistance to Needy Families	FC-Foster Care
MH-Mental Health	ER-Emergency Room	

Case Information

SY-16-063 FINAL Page 2 of 11



Report Type: Child Deceased **Jurisdiction:** Broome **Date of Death:** 11/28/2016

Age: 1 month(s) Gender: Male Initial Date OCFS Notified: 11/30/2016

Presenting Information

The SCR report alleged that on 11/28/16, 1-month-old child (CH) was murdered by abuse by one of BM's paramours. CH was buried in the backyard of the motel where the family members were staying. BM was unable to adequately support her 14-year-old son, 1-year-old twins, 1-year-old daughter, and a 1-month-old CH with necessary provisions. There's not enough food for the children (CHN) to eat and there was no formula for the 1 month old CH. As a result, the teenage son had shoplifted, dug in the motel dumpster looking for food, and the other CHN begged for food. The BM was unable to provide medical care for the CHN. One of the female CHN required a wheelchair and BM couldn't afford it. Also, at an unknown time, the male twin was malnourished, had a fractured skull and broken bones. The teenage son used marijuana and cocaine and had behavioral issues, and the BM failed to rectify the situation. MGM resided with the family and was also a subject of this report. BF had an unknown role.

Executive Summary

Broome County LDSS received the above SCR report on 11/30/16.

It was determined that none of these children existed and they were falsely reported. LDSS worked closely with LE, BM's doctor, local school districts and other collateral contacts to determine that these children did not exist. The alleged BM and BF both have developmental disabilities and mental health issues. BM was arrested in the past for making a false report to police regarding BF. There was a previous CPS case in October 2016, that also determined that the alleged children did not exist. LDSS took extensive steps to ensure to determine if these children ever existed. LE determined that they did not have enough information to press charges against anyone for making a false report.

Findings Related to the CPS Investigation of the Fatality

Safety Assessment:

• Was sufficient information gathered to make the decision recorded on the:

• Safety assessment due at the time of determination? Yes

Determination:

• Was sufficient information gathered to make determination(s) for all allegations as well as any others identified in the course of the investigation?

Yes, sufficient information was gathered to determine all allegations.

• Was the determination made by the district to unfound or indicate appropriate?

Yes

Was the decision to close the case appropriate?

Yes

Was casework activity commensurate with appropriate and relevant statutory Yes

or regulatory requirements?

Was there sufficient documentation of supervisory consultation? Yes, the case record has detail of the

consultation.



Explain:

CW did extensive work to find out if these children on the report existed and it was discovered that they did not.

Required Actions Related to the Fatality Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? $\square Yes \square No$ **Fatality-Related Information and Investigative Activities Incident Information Date of Death:** 11/28/2016 Time of Death: Unknown Time of fatal incident, if different than time of death: Unknown **BROOME** County where fatality incident occurred: Was 911 or local emergency number called? No Did EMS to respond to the scene? No At time of incident leading to death, had child used alcohol or drugs? N/A Child's activity at time of incident: ☐ Sleeping ☐ Working ☐ Driving / Vehicle occupant ☐ Playing ☐ Eating ☐ Unknown ☑ Other: Child was falsely reported and does not exist.

Did child have supervision at time of incident leading to death? No - Not needed given developmental age or circumstances

Total number of deaths at incident event:

Children ages 0-18: 0
Adults: 0

Household Composition at time of Fatality

Household	Relationship	Role	Gender	Age
Deceased Child's Household	Deceased Child	Alleged Victim	Male	1 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Grandparent	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	69 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Mother	Alleged Perpetrator	Female	36 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	Alleged Victim	Male	14 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	Alleged Victim	Female	10 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	Alleged Victim	Female	1 Year(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	Alleged Victim	Female	1 Month(s)
Deceased Child's Household	Sibling	Alleged Victim	Male	1 Year(s)

SY-16-063 FINAL Page 4 of 11



Other Household 1	Father	No Role	Male	36 Year(s)

LDSS Response

CW responded appropriately by checking the family history and seeing that the last case was determined to be a false report about child abuse. CW verified with LE that they received a law enforcement referral from the SCR. LE responded and spoke with BM and MGM who claimed they were being harassed by BM's ex-boyfriend who continued to call in false reports. LE witnessed no children in the home and the women denied there were any children. LE unfounded their report. CW reached out to local school districts to see if the school-aged children listed on the report were registered in any schools. The children named in the report were not enrolled in any local school districts. CW verified with BM's doctor, that in June 2015, BM had miscarried around 5 weeks. CW spoke with several collateral contacts who all confirmed that they had no knowledge that these children existed and had never seen the BM with children. CWs made several home visits and never witnessed any children in the home and never saw any evidence of children having lived in the home. CW checked with the hospital and local schools to see if there were any records of these children and there were none.

Official Manner and Cause of Death

Official Manner: Unknown

Primary Cause of Death: Unknown

Person Declaring Official Manner and Cause of Death: Unknown

Multidisciplinary Investigation/Review

Was the fatality investigation conducted by a Multidisciplinary Team (MDT)?Yes

Was the fatality reviewed by an OCFS approved Child Fatality Review Team? No

Comments: There was no deceased child; children did not exist.

SCR Fatality Report Summary

Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Allegation Outcome
036142 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Month(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
036142 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Month(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
036142 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Month(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	DOA / Fatality	Unsubstantiated
036142 - Deceased Child, Male, 1 Month(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Fractures	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69	Malnutrition / Failure to	Unsubstantiated

SY-16-063 FINAL Page 5 of 11



	Year(s)	Thrive	
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Fractures	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Lacerations / Bruises / Welts	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Malnutrition / Failure to Thrive	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Inadequate Food / Clothing / Shelter	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Lack of Medical Care	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Food / Clothing / Shelter	Unsubstantiated
036145 - Sibling, Male, 1 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Lack of Medical Care	Unsubstantiated
036146 - Sibling, Male, 14 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unsubstantiated
036146 - Sibling, Male, 14 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Lack of Medical Care	Unsubstantiated
036146 - Sibling, Male, 14 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Childs Drug / Alcohol Use	Unsubstantiated
036146 - Sibling, Male, 14 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
036146 - Sibling, Male, 14 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Lack of Medical Care	Unsubstantiated
036146 - Sibling, Male, 14 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
036146 - Sibling, Male, 14 Year(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Food / Clothing / Shelter	Unsubstantiated
036146 - Sibling, Male, 14 Year(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Inadequate Food / Clothing / Shelter	Unsubstantiated
036152 - Sibling, Female, 10 Month(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Food / Clothing / Shelter	Unsubstantiated
036152 - Sibling, Female, 10 Month(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
036152 - Sibling, Female, 10 Month(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Inadequate Food / Clothing / Shelter	Unsubstantiated
036152 - Sibling, Female, 10 Month(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Lack of Medical Care	Unsubstantiated

SY-16-063 FINAL Page 6 of 11



036152 - Sibling, Female, 10 Month(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
036153 - Sibling, Female, 1 Month(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Food / Clothing / Shelter	Unsubstantiated
036153 - Sibling, Female, 1 Month(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Inadequate Food / Clothing / Shelter	Unsubstantiated
036153 - Sibling, Female, 1 Month(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Lack of Medical Care	Unsubstantiated
036153 - Sibling, Female, 1 Month(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Lack of Medical Care	Unsubstantiated
036153 - Sibling, Female, 1 Month(s)	036141 - Mother, Female, 36 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated
036153 - Sibling, Female, 1 Month(s)	036149 - Grandparent, Female, 69 Year(s)	Inadequate Guardianship	Unsubstantiated

CPS Fatality Casework/Investigative Activities

	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine
All children observed?			×	
When appropriate, children were interviewed?			×	
Alleged subject(s) interviewed face-to-face?	X			
All 'other persons named' interviewed face-to-face?	X			
Contact with source?			×	
All appropriate Collaterals contacted?	X			
Was a death-scene investigation performed?			×	
Was there discussion with all parties (youth, other household members, and staff) who were present that day (if nonverbal, observation and comments in case notes)?			×	
Coordination of investigation with law enforcement?	X			
Was there timely entry of progress notes and other required documentation?	X			

Additional information:

It was discovered that the children named in this report do not exist. CW made contact with local schools, family members and LE to verify the non-existence of these children.

Fatality Safety Assessment Activities				
	Yes	No	N/A	Unable to Determine

SY-16-063 FINAL Page 7 of 11



Economic support								
Services Provided Offered, Offered, Offered, Offered Unknown offered Unavaliable Death Comments C	Were there any surviving siblings of	Were there any surviving siblings or other children in the household?						
Services Provided Offered, Offered, Offered, Offered Out not Offered Unavailable Death Refused Offered Offered Unavailable Offered Offered Offered Offered Unavailable Offered								
Services Provided Offered, Offered, Offered, Offered Out not Offered Unavailable Death Refused Offered Offered Unavailable Offered Offered Offered Offered Unavailable Offered								
Services Provided Offered, Offered, Offered, Offered Out not Offered Unavailable Death Refused Offered Offered Unavailable Offered Offered Offered Offered Unavailable Offered		I ena I	Activity Rel	ated to the Fa	tality			
Services Provided to the Family in Response to the Fatality Services		Legai	Activity Kei	ateu to the Fa	tanty			
Services Provided After Death Dea	Was there legal activity as a result	of the fatali	ty investiga	tion? There	was no leg	al activity.		
Services Provided After Death Dea								
N/A Lead to Refersal Refused If Used Offered Unavaliable N/A Lead to Referral Refused If Used Offered Unavaliable N/A Lead to Referral If Used If Us	Serv	vices Provide	d to the Fam	ily in Respons	se to the Fat	ality		
N/A Lead to Refersal Refused If Used Offered Unavaliable N/A Lead to Referral Refused If Used Offered Unavaliable N/A Lead to Referral If Used If Us		Provided	Offered	Offered	Naadad	Nooded		CDR
Bereavement counseling	Services						N/A	
Economic support		Death	Refused	if Used	Offered	Unavaliable		Referral
Funeral arrangements	Bereavement counseling					_		
Housing assistance	Economic support						X	
Mental health services	Funeral arrangements						X	
Foster care	Housing assistance						X	
Health care	Mental health services						×	
Legal services Family planning Homemaking Services Parenting Skills Domestic Violence Services Early Intervention Alcohol/Substance abuse Child Care Intensive case management Family or others as safety	Foster care						×	
Family planning	Health care						×	
Homemaking Services Parenting Skills Domestic Violence Services Early Intervention Alcohol/Substance abuse Child Care Intensive case management Family or others as safety	Legal services						X	
Parenting Skills Domestic Violence Services Early Intervention Alcohol/Substance abuse Child Care Intensive case management Family or others as safety	Family planning						\boxtimes	
Domestic Violence Services	Homemaking Services						×	
Early Intervention	Parenting Skills						X	
Alcohol/Substance abuse	Domestic Violence Services						×	
Child Care	Early Intervention						×	
Intensive case management	Alcohol/Substance abuse						×	
Family or others as safety	Child Care						×	
	Intensive case management						×	
resources	Family or others as safety						×	
Other	resources Other						☑	

Additional information, if necessary:

It was determined that the children did not exist, therefore none of these services were offered.

Were services provided to siblings or other children in the household to address any immediate needs and support their well-being in response to the fatality? No Explain:



It was determined the children listed on the report did not exist, therefore there was no need for services.

Were services provided to parent(s) and other care givers to address any immediate needs related to the fatality? No

Explain:

It was determined the children listed on the report did not exist, however, the adults listed on the report could have needed services.

History Prior to the Fatality

Child Inform	nation		
Did the child have a history of alleged child abuse/maltreatm	nent? No		
Was there an open CPS case with this child at the time of dea	ath? No		
Was the child ever placed outside of the home prior to the de	eath? No		
Were there any siblings ever placed outside of the home prio	or to this child's death? No		
Was the child acutely ill during the two weeks before death?	No		
, c			
Infants Under On	ne Year Old		
During pregnancy, mother:			
☐ Had medical complications / infections	☐ Had heavy alcohol use		
☐ Misused over-the-counter or prescription drugs	☐ Smoked tobacco		
☐ Experienced domestic violence ☐ Used illicit drugs			
☑ Was not noted in the case record to have any of the issues list	ted		
Infant was born:			
☐ Drug exposed	☐ With fetal alcohol effects or syndrome		
☑ With neither of the issues listed noted in case record	·		

CPS - Investigative History Three Years Prior to the Fatality

Date of SCR Report	Alleged Victim(s)	Alleged Perpetrator(s)	Allegation(s)	Status/Outcome	Compliance Issue(s)	
09/30/2016	13003 - Sibling, Female, 1 Years	13001 - Mother, Female, 36 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded	No	
	13004 - Sibling, Female, 9 Months	13001 - Mother, Female, 36 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded		
	13002 - Sibling, Male, 1 Years	13001 - Mother, Female, 36 Years	Inadequate Guardianship	Unfounded		
Report Summary:						



BM has multiple mental health issues and refuses to take her medication. BM is not mentally stable enough to take care of her three children **Determination:** Unfounded **Date of Determination:** 10/27/2016 **Basis for Determination:** CWs made extensive diligent efforts to see if these children actually existed and found no credible evidence that these children had ever existed. Searches for birth certificates, putative father registries and other data bases did not produce any results that would lead CPS to believe that children were ever born to BM. Home visits were made and never had any evidence of children living there. Collateral contacts confirmed BM was pregnant but did miscarry at approximately 5 weeks, in June 2015. **OCFS Review Results:** CW worked with several different agencies and made extensive attempts to find out if these children ever existed. CW concluded that this was a false report. Are there Required Actions related to the compliance issue(s)? $\square Yes \square No$ CPS - Investigative History More Than Three Years Prior to the Fatality There is no CPS history three years prior to the fatality. **Known CPS History Outside of NYS** There is no known CPS history outside of New York State. Required Action(s) Are there Required Actions related to compliance issues for provisions of CPS or Preventive services? □Yes ⊠No **Preventive Services History** There is no record of Preventive Services History provided to the deceased child, the deceased child's siblings, and/or the other children residing in the deceased child's household at the time of the fatality. **Legal History Within Three Years Prior to the Fatality** Was there any legal activity within three years prior to the fatality investigation? There was no legal activity

Additional Local District Comments

This case involves repeated intentional false reports to NYS' Central Registry (Child Abuse Hotline). NYS OCFS requires local Child Protective Services (CPS) fully investigate each repeated intentional false report, even reports about nonexistent children. NYS OCFS' current administrative process required OCFS write this child fatality report about a nonexistent child.

SY-16-063 FINAL Page 10 of 11



This case highlights how NYS OCFS' current practices permit false child abuse reporting to create an undue strain on NYS' Child Protective system (CPS).

NY State's Office of Children and Family Services needs to review its State Central Registry (SCR) intake policies and procedures to more effectively screen repeated false reports. Currently, NYS OCFS requires complete local CPS investigations, even in cases of repeated intentionally false reports. If NYS OCFS does not have administrative authority to improve their SCR screening process to limit this waste of resources, OCFS needs to develop a legislative proposal to solve this problem.

OCFS Reply:

The comments by the Broome County Department of Social Services fail to accurately reflect the statutory obligations imposed on the Office of Children and Family Services and local department of social services in regard to the receipt of reports of suspected child abuse or maltreatment, the conducting of investigations following the receipt of such reports and the issuance of fatality reports involving deaths reported to the State Central Register.

Recommended Action(s)					
Are there any recommended actions for local or state administrative or policy changes? □Yes ⊠No					
Are there any recommended prevention activities resulting from the review? □Yes ☒No					